

Glasgow Kelvin College**Board of Management****Audit and Risk Committee****Minute****Minute of the meeting held on Tuesday 14 February 2023 at 5pm via MS Teams****1. Sederunt**

Dermot Grenham (Chair in the absence of John Hogg);
Natalie Phillips;
Jennifer Lavery;
Elaine Clafferty; and
Michael O'Donnell.

In attendance:

Derek Smeall, Principal and Chief Executive;
Jeanette Evans, Vice Principal Operations;
Lisa Clark, Director of Estates and Corporate Services;
David Archibald, Henderson Loggie;
Debbie Friel, Senior Committee Coordinator (*for recording purposes*).

2. Apologies

John Hogg, (Chair)
Linda Ellison, Secretary to the Board;

3. Terms of Reference

Members noted the Terms of Reference. The meeting was quorate with 5 members in attendance.

4. Declarations of Interests and Connection**a) Interest****b) Connection**

No declarations of interest or connections were noted by members. The Chair reminded members that they could raise these at any point throughout the meeting.

5. Minute of the Previous Meeting held on 29 November 2022

Members accepted the minute as an accurate record of the business conducted at the meeting held on 29 November 2022.

6. a) Matters Arising from the Previous Meeting held on 29 November 2022

There were no items arising from the previous meeting held on 29 November 2022.

b) Action List

i) Audit and Risk Committee Action Log as at February 2023

J Evans reminded members that the action in relation to the Assurance Framework remained 'live' on the log. She highlighted that D Grenham, D Archibald and herself would review the framework prior to the Audit and Risk Committee Meeting scheduled for September 2023.

L Clark updated members on the live action pertaining to the issue of land at the Springburn Campus owned by HydePark Residents Association. She informed members that a meeting had been arranged with HydePark Residents Association for Thursday, 16th February 2023.

M O'Donnell requested that the completion dates are added to the action log.

7. Internal Audit Reports

a) Environmental Sustainability

D Archibald informed members that as part of the Internal Audit programme a review was carried out of the College's environmental sustainability arrangements. He explained that the Audit needs assessment identified this as an area where Internal Audit can assist in providing assurances to the Principal and the Audit and Risk Committee that the related control environment is operating effectively. He continued to say that no significant weaknesses were identified during the review, however, several opportunities for enhancing existing practices were included in the report, he referred to these opportunities as listed on page three of the report.

He informed members that the report was very positive overall with a grading of "Good", with 4 low level recommendations. He invited comments or questions.

The Vice Principal Operations highlighted that I Patrick was pleased with the work undertaken by the College's Environmental and Sustainability Manager, S Shea. Furthermore, J Evans reported that S Shea had been invited to the Board of Management's meeting scheduled for 13 March 2023, as a guest speaker. L Clark added that S Shea had made a significant impact in this area and she was delighted with the progress that had been achieved.

Dr E Clafferty commented that the Scottish Funding Council (SFC) guidelines referenced innovative approaches, and queried how the College would address this in terms of auditing. D Archibald spoke about the College understanding the causes and impacts of climate change and demonstrating new ways to effect change and develop knowledge for both staff and students and on innovative ways to improve on the College's carbon footprint.

M O'Donnell drew members attention to recommendation two within the report, which called for aligning the College's environmental strategies with its other strategies. He emphasised the potential challenges in achieving this alignment in a consistent and effective manner, and asked whether any organisations had successfully implemented their strategies and what the College would learn from

them. D Archibald highlighted that this was dependant on how the policies and strategies synced and that alignment was a challenge.

N Phillips thanked D Archibald for the positive report. She added that it was good to see audit aligning so succinctly with national policy level.

L Clark suggested that it may be useful to visit Dundee and Angus College as it had been suggested by the internal auditor that they had demonstrated high levels of good practice within this area. D Archibald agreed that the Dundee and Angus College were adept in generating positive publicity in regard to their environmental and sustainability initiatives and added that they have been focusing much longer in this area. He added that he also believed that Glasgow Kelvin College was equally accomplished.

The Principal informed members that he agreed with the suggestion of updating the various strategies. He added that aligning them with a common language is a natural improvement that will help members gain confidence in the cross-strategic element. He further added that commonality across all the main strategies will become more apparent and logical as work progresses.

The Principal responded to a comment from the Chair in reference to Curriculum relevance and stated that there was now a significant amount of content coming into all courses in relation to mainstreaming the green element. He added that currently this was more prevalent within our Engineering division and that S Shea was working with the faculties to bring consistency of approach.

In response to the Chair's query, J Evans noted that L Clark was responsible for reporting on the PSCCDR (Public Sector Climate Change Duties Report) and suggested that it might be beneficial to add a cover page to the annual update to showcase the diverse range of activities currently underway. L Clark highlighted that the College was actively reviewing several Audit Scotland reports, as well as pursuing the "Race to Zero" and the "Climate Action Plan" initiatives. L Clark informed members that she would be happy to bring a report back to the committee which covered all those aspects. *Members agreed that the Finance and Resources Committee should receive a comprehensive report on the subject as it was their remit, whilst the Governance Update paper for the Audit and Risk Committee could give reference.*

Members of the Audit and Risk Committee agreed to note the contents of the report.

b) Cyber Security

D Archibald informed members that this was a positive report. He highlighted that the report concluded that, overall, the College exhibits a strong awareness of cyber security risks and impacts, and that the control environment demonstrates good practice with many of the expected cyber security controls for an organisation of this size and complexity.

An overview of the four low level recommendations mentioned in the report was provided by D Archibald.

The Chair thanked D Archibald for his report and invited comments or questions.

The Chair queried the 'Management Response' to R1, referenced on page four of the report. This, he said, referenced refresher training and that he felt that the management response given seemed vague and the wording could be improved. The Principal agreed with the recommendation and emphasised the importance of keeping options open to determine the best way forward. He added that the College aimed to improve online training options to better monitor training effectiveness.

Members of the Audit and Risk Committee agreed to note the contents of the report.

8. Audit Action Plan

The Director of Estates and Corporate Services addressed the report's contents and reminded members of the College's commitment to maintaining a comprehensive Audit Action Plan, which outlined details of all audit recommendations, whether internal or external, classified as high, medium, or low grade.

L Clark informed members that currently there was twenty-five low level actions and one medium level actions outstanding, however, she added that the medium level action and five low level actions were considered to be complete by the College. She drew members attention to the link contained in the report which directed members to the Audit Action Plan which charts all actions. The Senior Management Team (SMT) review this on a fortnightly basis.

The Chair thanked L Clark for the comprehensive report and invited comment or questions.

Members of the Audit and Risk Committee agreed to:

- i) note the contents of this report and its appendices; and
- ii) approve the Audit Action Plan.

9. Internal Audit Progress Report

D Archibald spoke to the content of the report. He drew members attention to the audit areas within the annual plan and the scheduled dates for 2022/23.

M O'Donnell queried if there was sufficient timelines provided in order to complete the necessary fieldwork for the next two audits and to produce the reports, timeously, ahead of the next scheduled Audit and Risk Committee.

D Archibald explained that a discussion on the timelines had been held to ensure that the Executive lead and that their team were content, furthermore there would be early engagement prior to the fieldwork taking place.

Members of the Audit and Risk Committee agreed to note the contents of the report.

10. Risk Management Update and College Risk Register

The Director of Estates and Corporate Services spoke to the content of the report and reminded members that the College's Strategic Risk Register was considered at every meeting of the Audit and Risk Committee and Risk Management Committee.

L Clark drew members attention to the Risk Register Review table marked on page two of the report and highlighted that the risks had not changed since November 2022, with the inherent and residual scores also unchanged. She continued to provide members with a detailed overview of the report, where she elaborated on the Social/Economic Environment, the Cladding (Springburn Campus), Campus Reinvestment Programme and the Land at Springburn.

J Evans informed members that the first self-evaluation exercise had taken place for the Risk Management Committee. She drew members attention to the link to appendix two of the report which highlighted very positive results.

Following a question from the Chair, members had a lengthy discussion as to the term 'sustainable funding'. J Evans emphasised that the term sustainable was debatable and that the College had adopted the word 'stable' when referring to its budgets and its Operating Plan. The Principal added that there was much speculation as to whether the sector was sustainable over the next three to five years and that there was lack of definition from the Scottish Government.

The Chair thanked L Clark for her report.

Members of the Audit and Risk Committee agreed to note the contents of the report.

11. Governance Update

The Director of Estates and Corporate Services spoke to the content of the report and provided an update in relation to the following corporate governance areas:

- SPSO - the complaint was not upheld by SPSO.
- Cyber Essentials. Cyber Essentials Plus Certificate was attached as an appendix for members information.
- ChatGPT. New Open AI system, training was being given to establish positive aspects and the very real negatives. It was noted that work produced by ChatGPT was not picked up by the College's plagiarism systems.
- West End Campus. Consultations ongoing and a paper would be presented to the Board of Management at its March 2023 meeting .
- Catering Tender. This is being prepared presently and will go in March 2023.
- Martyns Law. Comes into effect early spring, tabletop exercise will be undertaken due to enhanced duties.
- Umal Conference. L Clark attended the conference on the Escape of Water.

The Chair thanked L Clark for presenting a comprehensive report and invited questions or comments.

M O'Donnell queried if any ICT security risks had been identified with Clyde Campus temporarily using space at the College's West End Campus, in particularly from a network, cyber security point of view. L Clark advised members that J Quinn was

fully involved with this transition and that the College's insurance company had been fully informed.

Dr E Clafferty, thanked L Clark for a very informative report. She added that it was reassuring to know that the College had picked up on the ChatGPT intelligence and that both the positives and negatives were being scrutinised, especially in terms of student assessments.

Members of the Audit and Risk Committee agreed to note the contents of the report and its appendices.

12. Freedom of Information and Data Protection Request Monitoring January 2022 – December 2022

The Director of Estates and Corporate Services spoke to the content of the report that sought to provide reassurance to members that requests received are responded to in accordance with the requirements of both the Freedom of Information Act and the Data Protection Act.

L Clark provided a summary of the number of requests received between January 2022 and December 2022 and drew members' attention to the statistics shown within the table on page one of the report. She highlighted that the College had demonstrated a 100% compliance rate for responding within the designated time frames. Furthermore, the College had received no request for review and there were no appeals to the Information Commissioner during 2022.

The Chair noted that he was content that there were no wider concerns resulting from the requests received.

Members of the Audit and Risk Committee agreed to:

- i) note the contents of this report;
- ii) note the number of FOI/Data Protection requests received for the period January 2022 – December 2022;
- iii) note that the College has submitted the required quarterly FOI returns for the Information Commissioner; and
- iv) note that the College will continue to have due regard to both the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2022 and Data Protection Act 2018 and adhere to the timescales required.

13. Audit Scotland

a) Technical Bulletin 2022/24

Members noted the content of the Technical Bulletin provided for their information.

14. Risk Management – Risk issues to be considered as a consequence of the consideration of the above agenda

Members agreed that no new risk management issues had arisen as a consequence of the business conducted at the meeting held on 14 February 2023.

- 15. Equality Management – Equality issues to be considered as a consequence of the consideration of the above agenda**
Members agreed that no new equality management issues had arisen as a consequence of the business conducted at the meeting held on 14 February 2023.
- 16. Data Protection – Data Protection issues to be considered as a consequence of the consideration of the above agenda**
Members agreed that no new data protection issues had arisen as a consequence of the business conducted at the meeting held on 14 February 2023.
- 17. Impact on Students – Student impact to be considered as a consequence of the consideration of the above agenda**
Members agreed that no impact on students had arisen as a consequence of the business conducted at the meeting held on 14 February 2023.
- 18. Closure**
The meeting closed at 6.30pm with the Chair thanking members from the attendance and contributions.
- 19. Date of Next Meeting**
16 May 2023, Room MF12/14 East End Campus